

Crossing Boundaries of Womanhood:  
Professionalization and American Women Missionaries'  
Quest for Higher Education in Meiji Japan  
(ウーマンフッドを越えて：  
明治期日本のアメリカ女性宣教師の高等教育推進  
に見られるプロフェッショナルリゼーション)

Noriko Ishii\*

**SUMMARY IN JAPANESE:** アメリカ女性宣教師の研究は1970年代以降のアメリカ女性史の発展を受け、80年代半ば以降盛んになってきた。ただし、宣教研究は本国に残された資料の性質上、本国の宣教理念が宣教師にいかん反映されているかを明らかにすることに偏りがちである。本稿は、「宣教活動の本質は異なる文化の関係そのもの」とする1997年の宣教歴史家ダナ・L・ロバートによる指摘を踏まえて、1880年代1890年代に、神戸英和女学校(後の神戸女学院)で高等教育を推進するべく努力した3人の独身女性宣教師の活動を対象とした。反キリスト教の風潮が高まってきた1894年になぜ、高等教育が成立したのか、様々な困難にもかかわらず、この女性宣教師たちを高等教育実施へ向けて駆り立てた原動力は何なのか、考察したい。宣教活動を規定した様々な利害関係を調整しつつ、日本側の女子教育要望に鋭敏に反応したこと、そして自らの恩恵とみなした高等教育を日本女性の地位向上に役立たせたいという、プロフェッショナルとしての目的意識があったことを指摘したい。プロフェッショナルリゼーションについて、アメリカ女性史では、世俗的職業について研究がなされたが、海外宣教地で活動した宣教師についてはこれまで論じられて来なかった。結果的に、日本での宣教経験は本国では得られないほど、女性に女性だけで事業展開を行う自治と自立の機会となった。

---

\* 石井 紀子 Lecturer, Department of English Language and Studies, Sophia University, Tokyo, Japan.

“It is our hope that this school will in time become a college, Miss Searle and I have been working steadily toward that end ever since we came to Japan,” confessed Emily M. Brown to N. G. Clark, the Foreign Secretary of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (hereafter American Board) in January 1889.<sup>1</sup> Emily M. Brown was the first single woman missionary to come to Kobe Girls’ School as a college graduate in 1882. Brown and two other college-educated women missionaries launched on a decade-long struggle to expand the existing missionary girls’ school into Kobe College. Kobe College, in the end, became one of the pioneer women’s colleges in Japan.

Belonging to the first generation of American women with collegiate training, these missionaries equated women’s higher education and Christianity. This mission theory<sup>2</sup> marked a significant departure from the earlier mission theory in the 1870s. The earlier mission theory set priority on evangelization and saw education as a means for evangelization, abiding by the American Board’s goal to plant indigenous churches. Remarkably the collegiate department opened in 1894 amid heightening anti-Christian and nationalistic sentiment in Meiji Japan. With increasing governmental control over women’s education in the 1890s, Japanese governmental construction of gender proceeded. Ironically, collegiate status enabled the school to maintain its Christian emphasis. I suggest that the case study of this college scheme provides a unique lens to study the intersection of missionary experience, mission theory, American women’s culture, and Japanese indigenous culture.

By examining how and why the college expansion survived in Meiji Japan, this study intends to explore what the missionaries gained from this Kobe work. It also seeks to examine the impact of the missionary experience in a cross-cultural setting on how the missionaries shaped their mission theory and how their mission theory related to the general mission policy of the American Board at large. I will attempt to connect the shift in mission theory exemplified in the college expansion to the professionalization that took place in overall American women’s culture at the time.<sup>3</sup> More importantly, I will argue that the college scheme was a missionary response to increasing Japanese demand for and interest in women’s advanced education.

Past scholarship on missionary studies up to the 1970s had centered either on hagiographies and celebratory accounts by those closely associated with the mission boards or on a denunciation of the missionary movement as a self-conceited disguise of what historian Arthur Schlesinger, Jr. criticized as “cultural

imperialism.” Schlesinger’s definition of “cultural imperialism” as “purposeful aggression by one culture against the ideas and values of another”<sup>4</sup> underscored the nineteenth century adverse imagery of missionaries created by external literary critics. Herman Melville and Mark Twain indicted the missionaries for destroying “a once-happy people.” This negative tone in dismissing missionary experience as a historical “embarrassment” discouraged scholarly attention.

A renewed revival of scholarly attention to the missionary movement since the mid-1980s owes largely to the development of U.S. women’s history in the 1970s with proliferating interests in nineteenth-century “women’s culture.”<sup>5</sup> Feminist historians’ perspective opened the way for a positive reassessment of the movement and led to studies by Jane Hunter (1984) and Patricia R. Hill (1985) on American women missionaries in China. Furthermore, intellectual historian William R. Hutchison’s pioneering study (1987) of general mission theory of the men in missions added to the revisionist interpretation of the movement in the literature of mission studies.<sup>6</sup>

By the 1990s, another new perspective emerged out of the 1980s explosion of scholarship on mission history to consider mission history as a part of what mission historian Dana L. Robert called “the dynamic interplay of cultures.” From this perspective, scholars began to criticize that the main thrust of mission studies in the 1980s was one-sided with a focus on the missionaries themselves. As historian Peggy Pascoe observed, “most historians of women who focused on missionary sources used them to understand missionary women”<sup>7</sup> rather than to understand relations between missionaries and the indigenous women who were the targets of their work. Three important studies by Peggy Pascoe (1990), Pui-Lan Kowk (1992) and Kohiyama Rui (1992) were produced in line with this perspective.<sup>8</sup>

This essay builds on Dana L. Robert’s call to see the role of missionary as “transmitter of cross-cultural information” or in historian Yoshida Ryo’s words, “the agent of cultural interaction at the mission front. (my translation)”<sup>9</sup> Considering “missions as essentially a relationship between different cultures,”<sup>10</sup> this study seeks to explore how the missionaries responded to native needs and how they maneuvered through various forces involved to pursue their goal. The forces women missionaries negotiated included the male-run parent board of the American Board, the male missionaries of the Japan Mission encompassing the American Board missionaries in Japan, and the women of the Woman’s Board of Missions of the Interior (hereafter WBMI), a separate women’s board of the home

base in charge of Kobe Girls' School. Amid shifting gender ideologies both in Japan and in U.S., missionaries were compelled to redefine their balancing point often. The study relies on analysis of the missionaries' correspondence in American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM) Papers, the annual reports of the WBMI and *Life and Light for (Heathen) Women*, periodicals issued by the women's boards. The limitation of this study lies in its focus on the missionaries's viewpoint to explore the relationship between different cultures, owing to the nature of the sources consulted.

To date Dana L. Robert's *American Women in Mission* (1997) is the first comprehensive analysis of changing mission theory of the women in mission from the nineteenth century to the Second World War encompassing mainline Protestant, Evangelical and Catholic women. It adds significantly to R. Pierce Beaver's classical study, *American Protestant Women in World Mission* (1980), an extensive survey of women in mainline Protestant foreign missionary institutions, which still offers a wealth of resources today. Robert discusses the Congregational women missionaries of the American Board chiefly as pioneer missionary women who went to the foreign mission fields as missionary wives between 1812 and 1850. With a thorough analysis, Robert showed that the mission theory of the early nineteenth century was shaped by the consensus between Rufus Anderson's three-self theory and Mary Lyon's principle that the goal of education for women was to make women "useful." The mission policy of Rufus Anderson, the Foreign Secretary of the American Board at the time, in favor of self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating indigenous churches illustrated Anderson's priority on evangelization, that is, planting indigeneous churches over civilization or education as the primary mission goal. Mary Lyon's emphasis on education, piety and self-sacrifice produced a stream of women missionaries from Mount Holyoke.<sup>11</sup>

Robert's discussions on the mission theory of the late nineteenth century focused on the Methodists' case and almost none on the American Board. Nevertheless, in a brief reference, Robert assessed the American Board women missionaries as conservative in the late nineteenth century when the prevailing missiology shifted to the mission theory of "Woman's Work for Women" (hereafter "woman's work").<sup>12</sup> Compared with Methodist women whose mission work focused on education and social work, Robert noted that Congregational women remained obedient to Anderson's three-self theory. According to Robert, Methodist leaders of the Woman's Foreign Missionary Society saw "no contradiction



among evangelization, experiences of holiness, and the higher education of women.”<sup>13</sup> Robert showed that although Congregational women carefully remained within the parameters of Anderson’s three-self theory, they quietly worked to reverse Anderson’s strictures in action and that by 1885 they succeeded in “throwing off the three-self incubus in Ceylon.”<sup>14</sup>

Precisely in the mid-1880s, the college-educated Congregational missionaries at Kobe Girls’ School conflated higher education with evangelization. I intend to fill the gap and expand on Robert’s thesis by identifying this as an important shift in Congregational women’s mission theory. Specifically this study will add to Robert’s view on the following two dimensions: first, this study will fill the gap by examining Congregational women’s missionary work in the late nineteenth century under the slogan of “woman’s work,” omitted in Robert’s work. I intend to complicate Robert’s view by showing that even within the late nineteenth century, Congregational women’s mission theory shifted over time. By the mid-1880s, Congregational women missionaries at Kobe Girls’ School envisioned “social uplift” of Japanese women through higher education as their mission goal. This echoes Robert’s analysis of Methodist women, suggesting diversity among Congregational women. Woman’s Board of Missions (hereafter WBM) women’s special ties with the American Board in common geographical location and frequent matrimonial bonds with American Board officers compelled them to remain conservative and abide by the mission theory of the American Board. Perhaps WBMI women, in contrast, enjoyed more freedom from the American Board’s policy because of the geographical distance from Boston and the liberal culture of women’s social activism in Chicago in the late nineteenth century. Second, I will attempt to link this shift in mission theory to missionary response to indigenous culture and the professionalization that took place in overall women’s culture.

### **The Mechanism of “Woman’s Work” under the American Board**

Based on a legendary origin in an evangelical revival of the so-called “Haystack Prayer Meeting” in 1806, the American Board was organized in 1810 as the first church-affiliated foreign mission society in the U.S. Women were sent out as assistant missionaries primarily as the wives of the male missionaries prior to the postbellum formation of separate women’s boards. The male officers of the American Board, Foreign Secretary Rufus Anderson in particular, the major mission theoretician at the time, were hesitant to send single women missionaries abroad because they were bound by the nineteenth century gender ideology that

American single women, “white” single women in particular, had to be protected from unexpected dangers in “heathen” lands. With increasing calls for single women missionaries from the mission field, both from the male missionaries and the native women, a number of separate women’s boards for foreign missions were organized across denominations during and after the Civil War. Three separate women’s boards connected to the American Board were formed: the Woman’s Board of Missions of Boston in January 1868, the Woman’s Board of Missions of the Interior of Chicago in October of the same year and finally the Woman’s Board of the Pacific (WBMP) separated from the WBMI in 1873. The formation of separate women’s boards opened the possibility for increasing numbers of single women to seek careers as assistant foreign missionaries. Missionary career was one of the few professions permitted in nineteenth century Victorian gender ideology as “womanly” along with teaching, nursing and writing. The women in missions contributed significantly to the revival of foreign missions in the 1870s. As historian Patricia Hill noted, the women’s foreign missionary movement emerged “as the largest of the great nineteenth-century women’s movement and as perhaps the largest nineteenth-century religious movement in America.”<sup>15</sup>

Women missionaries of the American Board worked in the mission field under systematized cooperation of the following three forces: the parent male-run board of the American Board in Boston, three women’s boards of the WBM, WBMI and WBMP, and the Japan Mission, the community of all missionaries appointed by the American Board in Japan. The women’s boards functioned in fund-raising, supporting single women missionaries and their missionary work, and in disseminating missionary information to American women and children. The Prudential Committee was the highest decision-making organ of the American Board that made the official decisions of missionary appointment and appropriations for the Japan Mission including missionary salaries and the expenditures for missionary work. The Japan Mission held annual conferences and voted on the resolutions to be submitted to the American Board as the requests from the field. As the Foreign Secretary of the American Board served as the transmitter between the Japan Mission and the Prudential Committee, the missionaries wrote letters to the Foreign Secretary to report their work as well as with the hope of persuading the secretary to work in favor of their requests.

During the first decade after the formation of separate women’s boards, the division of labor among the three forces operated in the following way: women’s boards recommended candidates of women missionaries to the American Board,

but the authority to appoint missionaries and decide the annual appropriation of mission funds to different mission work rested with the American Board. Once missionaries were appointed to Japan by the American Board, the Japan Mission was given the discretion to assign each missionary to a specific geographical location named "Station" if the mission work was large enough in size and missionaries resided there. If "woman's work" in Japan required a certain amount of money, the women missionaries officially made the request to the American Board through the resolution of the Japan Mission and the American Board weighed all the requests from the mission field worldwide to make the final decision on the appropriation. Once the annual appropriation was decided, the American Board assigned specific amounts of funds to be raised by each women's board. Thus the women's boards' initial contact with the mission field was through recommendation of missionary candidates and correspondence with specific missionaries that they supported. The general rule was that funds raised by the women's boards were sent annually in a lump sum to the American Board. Yet, by the first decade, missionary experience in the field created a few exceptions in which the American Board assigned some specific "woman's work" to separate women's boards. The funds for these specific objects were set aside from the lump sum sent to the American Board.

### **The College Idea and the American Board**

Emily M. Brown (Carleton, Class of 1882) and Susan A. Searle (Wellesley, Class of 1881) arrived at Kobe Girls' School in 1882 and 1883 respectively as the first women missionaries with college education and a few years of teaching experience after graduation. They differed in nature from the single missionaries at Kobe Girls' School in the previous decade in mission theory, educational background, age of appointment and motivation patterns.<sup>16</sup> Although the mission goal of evangelization through work for women continued from the previous decade, these women clearly envisioned utilizing their benefits of collegiate education for the social advancement of Japanese women and were attracted to the idea of developing the school into a college from the beginning of their appointment. They had attained the highest possible education for women in America and understood that their relative superior status in society compared with that of Japanese women was accorded to them by both Christianity and collegiate training. Brown and Searle had known each other at Carleton College where Brown studied and Searle taught. They were recruited through college connec-

tions and were in their twenties at appointment because they had chosen the career of missionary as a way to utilize their expertise for social service. This pattern was distinct from missionaries of the previous decade who were motivated by family connections and were appointed almost in their mid-thirties when their marriage prospects were low. Most of these missionaries also had the best education at seminaries available at the time but had limited marriage options because of male casualties in the Civil War. The most distinctive contrast was that their primary mission goal lay in evangelization, that is, saving the heathen women and they regarded education merely as a means to gain access to women.

Brown and Searle connected Christianity and women's higher education in multiple ways. Just like the Grimké sisters, the antebellum abolitionist thinkers, they applied the egalitarian emphasis of Christianity to justify women's education.

Surely the Christian element of America, which is represented by the Am. Board and its missionaries, believes in higher education for women. If it is right and wise for the Board to establish a Christian coll.[ege] for boys, surely a Christian coll.[ege] for girls would be no more than a just exponent of the Christian American estimate of womanhood.<sup>17</sup>

Brown alluded to the egalitarian orientation of Christianity which had justified the development of women's higher education in America and extended the same argument to justify Christian colleges for women as a necessary means for efficient evangelization of Japan.

In addition, Brown, Searle and Mary Anna Holbrook who later arrived in 1889 identified with the social service orientation of Christianity seen in Mary Lyon. Mary Lyon believed that the purpose of religious culture lay in cultivating "disinterested benevolence" or Christian service. The goal of women's education was to make women "useful" by applying the knowledge they sought for their service to God. Hence the notion of "social service" emphasized the compatibility between faith and knowledge and linked Christianity with women's higher education. Characteristic to Mary Lyon's conceptualization of knowledge and faith was that she firmly believed that the teachings of the Bible formed the foundation of any knowledge of the natural world. Thereby new discoveries in science would serve to glorify God; she did not anticipate that conflicts would emerge between science and religion. Mary Anna Holbrook's passion for the scientific education of Japanese women at Kobe College at the turn-of-the-century exemplified such

Lyon's religious approach to science. Lyon further appealed to her students to extend themselves to the women and children in the American West and overseas in the same spirit of disinterested benevolence.<sup>18</sup>

Finally, the three missionaries combined the female professional concept of "domestic housekeeping" or "domestic feminism" with Mary Lyon's social service orientation of Christianity. This offered a peculiarly woman's orientation to applying knowledge to society's benefit. In the 1880s and 1890s, the first generation of college-graduated women were creating new professions that reconciled their professional ambitions and their desire to serve. To legitimize women's participation in civic reform, this concept was built on the premise that "women possessed special moral qualities which ought to be applied outside the home" and that "the community was the extension of the home."<sup>19</sup> Searle described the aim and scope of Japanese women's colleges in this light:

The education we give should show to the Japanese girl possibilities of reform and progress in the home life and the public life of the nation and teach her how to do her share toward this progress, while, at the same time it should not so educate her away from her own people that she will be unhappy in the life to which she must return after leaving school.<sup>20</sup>

Searle, not only utilized her own "professional expertise" in educating and evangelizing Japanese girls but also expected her Japanese students to extend their "professional knowledge and expertise" acquired through collegiate education at Kobe College to "reform" Japanese homes and society. Thus by combining traditions old and new, these missionaries equated women's higher education and Christianity and further combined their professional aspirations in this equation.

The emergence of such professional aspirations among these missionaries parallels the professionalization that was taking place in American women's culture in general at the time. According to historian Nancy F. Cott, professionals were self-defined as "experts who gave the benefits of their education, authority and service to society in return for pay, recognition and influence."<sup>21</sup> Ruth Oldenziel, a historian on gender and technology, states that the "ethos of professionalization" is embodied in the aura of independence, the esprit de corps, the sense of service to society, special knowledge and cultural authority.<sup>22</sup> The hallmarks of professions lie in specialized skills, training, and service. The mission theory of these college-educated missionaries embodied these features. Previous scholarship on

women and professionalization concentrated on studies of women in secular professions such as women in medicine, nursing, law, social work and teaching.<sup>23</sup> Lack of scholarly attention to the professionalization of missionary women except for Patricia R. Hill's work (1985) attests to the conventional perception of missionaries as conservative guardians of women's sphere. The strenuous commitment of college-educated women missionaries for college expansion at Kobe in spite of many difficulties they encountered and Mary Anna Holbrook's insistence on utilizing her expertise in science and medicine for Japanese women's scientific education and sanitary reform in Japan epitomized the missionaries' professional motivations, as we shall see.

The women missionaries and the WBMI united in their professional aspiration to develop Kobe Girls' School into a college. The greatest obstacle for these women in the early 1880s was the American Board and the male missionaries in the Japan Mission who abided by their mission theory on planting indigenous churches. With a clear priority on the evangelization of Japan, they sustained traditional tension against knowledge and civilization. Hence the American Board and male missionaries could adopt education only if it functioned as an effective tool to expedite evangelization. Moreover, they were gender-biased in their attention to women's education.

In addition, the Japanese context where these missionaries operated witnessed turbulent years in the 1880s and 1890s with shifting political identities. What underlay the fashion to Westernize in the 1880s was Japan's process of sorting out a modern national identity. In order to become a civilized modern nation, Japanese leaders felt they had to transform Japan from what it had been in the past, yet at the same time to retain continuity to formulate a stable identity. In this quest, the Japanese were seeking how much would be Western and how much traditional, and how these elements would combine. Within such a context, the main issue for the missionaries was to find a balancing point with Japanese interests. During such difficult years, the greatest concerns for the missionaries were to keep the school under mission control, to sustain Christianizing efforts, and to develop college departments to train Japanese women educators.

Westernization made the missionary schools teaching English, Western culture and etiquette more and more attractive for the Japanese. Their popularity was gaining so rapidly that student enrollment multiplied dramatically from 97 in 1884, to the peak of 193 in 1888. As nationalistic sentiment rose after 1889, the number dropped yearly to a low of 72 in 1894. The rapid increase of student

enrollments obliged the missionaries to make incessant requests for the expansion of the campus. An addition of one building did not suffice as the student enrollment soared. Although most of the expansions were funded from American sources, in some cases Japanese Christians also gave donations. For example, of the 2,500 yen required for building the new auditorium in 1887, the WBMI funded 975 yen whereas Japanese supporters gave 1,545.92 yen, about 75 % of the total cost. The Board was reluctant to fund one particular girls' school repeatedly when they oversaw several other girls' schools in Japan. Anticipating such criticisms, the women missionaries tried to convince the Board how promising their school was and that it would not incur too heavy a burden on the Board. For this purpose, the missionaries tactfully used the fact that the tuition was beginning to cover the expenses at a greater share every year as strong supporting evidence.

Seizing the circumstances, the women missionaries launched their college scheme as well as responded to the Japanese need to attract more students. The missionaries seized on the increasing Japanese desire for Western culture and made several revisions to emphasize their expertise in educating for Western refinement. To meet the growing demand for Western dresses, a course in Western sewing was started in September 1886. In the following year, the missionaries decided to prohibit the use of Japanese in English classes to promote English proficiency among the girls, which was what the Japanese most earnestly desired. When the new auditorium was opened in 1888, the dining room adopted Western-style chairs and tables for the first time, instead of the tatami mats that had been hitherto used in the old dining room. What was significant in these developments was the fact that the missionaries adroitly made these accommodations to Japanese demand for refinement in Western civilization hand in hand with launching their dream for a woman's college. This skillful balancing of both American and Japanese interests became characteristic of the subsequent pursuit of the development of Kobe College. The enhancement of religious education also went hand in hand with revisions for Western civilization. Daily chapel meetings were incorporated into school routine about 1888 and religious fervor among the students culminated in the Revival of 1889, in which 60 girls were baptized. This marked the only large-scale revival in the history of Kobe College. At the end of the Western period, the Japanese saw English proficiency as proof of Western adaptation, while the missionaries saw it as a basis for Christian women's education.

Both the missionaries and the WBMI believed that the college idea came from

the Japanese demand. "There is a demand for more advanced study," reported the annual report of the WBMI of 1885:

Two young graduates of the last class have begged the privilege of studying two or three years longer, a request which their father has warmly seconded. The number of such fathers and daughters is increasing in Japan, and a year of post-graduate study has been added to the course.<sup>24</sup>

Women missionaries and the women at the home base of the WBMI, reading the letters from their women missionaries, were responding to what they believed were Japanese demands. Western women, however, miscalculated Japanese desires. As J.H. DeForest, an American Board missionary reported, some Japanese intellectuals came to recognize by 1885 that "something, either Christianity or civilization, has given the women of the West a position that excites their admiration and earnest longing to have the women of Japan gain a similar place of influence." Toyama, a professor of Tokyo Imperial University, wrote an appeal in the newspapers to the missionaries "to even abandon altogether their evangelistic work and to unite in forming five or six flourishing Christian girls' schools in the capital." The missionaries in Japan decided to seize on this ripe opportunity in which "not only Christian churches, but non-Christian philanthropists, are looking to Christianity as to the only force they know of that will lift woman out of her ignorance and degradation, and enable her to exert such an influence in the home as the women of Christian lands do."<sup>25</sup>

The college-educated women missionaries at the school had equated the mission goal of spreading Christianity to the "heathen" women with advancing the status of Japanese women. For them, the advanced status accorded to American women was due to Christianity and superior education. Thus they translated Japanese demand for advanced education of women to be of the highest possible education available in the U.S., their home country, i.e., higher education. With such interpretations by the women missionaries, the Japan Mission voted unanimously at the 1885 Annual Meeting that they desired to develop an institution for women's higher education and that they would develop this at Kobe Girls' School. Perhaps Japanese intellectuals had preferred women's education to evangelism among the missionary work because they found that the education of women was essential for Japan to develop into a country of civilization. Moreover, what they meant by women's education was probably secondary education



and not collegiate education. Thus the claim that the college idea came from the Japanese themselves was likely, at best, a misinterpretation on the missionaries' part. The student enrollment in the college department remained small, with the number of graduates ranging from zero to six, and an average of 2.1.<sup>26</sup>

The WBMI was nevertheless thrilled by the idea of developing Kobe Girls' School into a women's Christian college. Years before the school was officially renamed "Kobe College" in 1894, their annual reports called the school "the Japanese Wellesley," "the Mt. Holyoke of Japan" and quoted the title of "Kobe University" from one of the graduates' commencement speeches, implying their earnest desire for a college.

The belief that the college for Japanese women was an indigenous Japanese demand turned out to be an effective strategy to convince the American Board who were attentive to native demand. Abiding by Anderson's three-self theory, the Board would provide approval, "whenever the natives are ready to meet the substantial expenditure, or a considerable part of it."<sup>27</sup> Emily M. Brown, collaborating with Susan A. Searle, maneuvered skillfully with N. G. Clark, the Foreign Secretary of the American Board, and with the male missionaries of the Japan Mission to push through the crusade for a college. The rapidly increasing student enrollment and the steady increase of the Japanese share of operating funds provided an excellent opportunity for Brown and Searle to push forward their dream for a college. Searle proudly reported that "the boarding department entirely supports itself."<sup>28</sup>

Kobe, as well as successfully using its Western appeal, fortuitously avoided anti-Western conflicts that were already appearing at the other two girls' schools affiliated with the American Board. Of the three girls' schools under the American Board in the *Kansai* [Western Japan] region, Kobe Girls' School was the only one under complete mission control. Doshisha Girls' School in Kyoto, attached to Doshisha Theological Training School, was under both mission and Japanese control whereas Baika Girls' School in Osaka, although affiliated with the American Board, was under Japanese control. The misunderstanding of both the Japanese and the mission as to how much control each party was entitled to at Doshisha Girls' School caused friction and turmoil between the two parties. Finally in 1885, when Brown and Searle began the campaign to raise Kobe Girls' School to collegiate level, the dispute at Doshisha Girls' School led to the decision of the American Board to withdraw all their missionaries from Doshisha and the school was forced to close down temporarily.<sup>29</sup>

Fully aware of the difficulties Doshisha Girls' School was facing when N. G. Clark suggested that Doshisha would be a better candidate for a woman's college in Japan, Emily M. Brown responded,

I will only say that I think not a single member of the Mission will vote for the most advanced school for girls to be located in Kiyoto [*sic*]. I can easily see the advantages to which you refer, but there are objections which counterbalance them many times over. These objections, the Kiyoto Missionaries are more competent to explain than I am.<sup>30</sup>

The question was discussed at the Mission Meeting of the Japan Mission in June 1885. "It was the unanimous (I think) opinion of the Mission that a school for girls, of a higher grade than any we have at present would be a valuable adjunct to Missionary work in Japan," reported Brown to Clark. The Mission resolved to "close the Kiyoto school and enlarge" Kobe Girls' School. Brown continued,

The training of teachers, as well as of wives and mothers, is to be a prominent feature of the school, but the training is to become in accordance with the methods pursued at Wellesly [*sic*] and Smith, rather than with those in operation in normal schools.<sup>31</sup>

Brown's vision to create a college was clearly aimed at developing the highest standard of women's colleges available at that time in the U.S. and not at the lower level of the normal schools which required less rigorous training. This was a significant departure from American Board's policy to limit education to the level of normal schools.

Emily M. Brown and Susan A. Searle were proponents of the ideal Christian womanhood for Kobe girls. They believed in its supremacy, its universality and its empowering potential as a notion of womanhood. In agony over anti-Western sentiment later, Brown defended herself, saying that her purpose was to train the girls into Japanese ladies and that she did not have the least desire to make them American.<sup>32</sup>

Successfully achieving consensus among the Japan Mission and the American Board to put the college scheme in effect at Kobe Girls' School, Emily M. Brown took meticulous care in making the plan. "This is certainly a very important time in the history of the school," wrote Brown, "We are making plans, not for a few

years but for a generation, and infinite care and wisdom was needed to avoid making mistakes."<sup>33</sup> Brown, ambitious to make the woman's college at Kobe Girls' School a lasting establishment, planned carefully to make her ideals come true. She again pressed on the significance of a women's college to N. G. Clark in January 1889:

But, Dr. Clark, it is our hope that this school will in time, become a college, . . . and we believe that we have the hearty approval and cooperation of the other members of the Mission in our efforts.<sup>34</sup>

N. G. Clark, in response, stressed the priority on Christian purpose, "Whatever we may do in the way of higher education is and always must be subordinate to its Christian purpose and Christian use."<sup>35</sup>

Brown sought to develop the college step by step. In order to specialize the school toward secondary and higher education, the Primary Department ceased to admit any new class in 1885. Keenly aware of competition from prospective government high schools, Brown advocated compliance with the Japanese government system in terms of the years of study. When the *Kyoiku Rei* (Education Ordinance) was revised in 1886, which divided the primary schools into two levels with four years of study for each, Brown revised the program at Kobe Girls' School so that its years of study equaled those at the government schools.

One of the favorite methods of Emily M. Brown and Susan A. Searle was to use gender to convince the American Board that their request was reasonable. They compared their conditions to those at Doshisha, their male counterpart. Doshisha was the American Board's endeavor for a men's college in Kyoto, and was jointly founded with Nijima, the first Japanese to be ordained and appointed as an American Board missionary to Japan in the U.S. "When I consider the girls of Japan, and the appropriations which are constantly being made for the Doshisha, my hesitation vanishes completely," wrote Brown to Dr. Clark in January 1889, right before the assassination of Mori Arinori on February 11, 1889 which marked the rise of nationalistic sentiment. Susan A. Searle also pointed to the American Board's gender bias on December 17, 1887 in telling Clark: "This work for girls seems increasingly important, and I cannot help wondering sometimes why we cannot have for our girls more nearly an equal share with the boys' school in buildings, library, and other appliances." When Clark argued that the college scheme could not be granted unless more funds could be solicited from the Japanese, Brown rebutted,

But why ought the girls' schools to be self supporting any more than the Doshisha? Granted as you say, that more money has been spent directly on this school than anywhere else in Japan for women, it is not a seventh part of what is being spent for the Doshisha, and are we not to consider that the girls of Japan are even one seventh as valuable as the boys?<sup>36</sup>

Brown reminded him that it was against Christian beliefs to consider less of Japanese girls than of Japanese boys. Brown pointed out the egalitarian emphasis of Christianity discussed earlier (See p. 92 of this article.) and continued, "Of course it is understood that the boys must be provided for first. That is a matter of course in Christian as well as in unChristian countries," in a pointed sarcasm. But:

To be sure there is a large and well equipped Gov't University for boys in Tokyo, while in the whole Empire, there is not a single college, either Christian or unChristian, for girls.<sup>37</sup>

When Mary A. Holbrook arrived at Kobe, she added her weight to Brown's and Searle's advocacy. Holbrook, a non-graduate of Mount Holyoke, who was one of the pioneer women to receive a medical degree from the University of Michigan in 1881, had previous experience as a medical missionary in China. She had stopped by Japan on her way home from China and was attracted by the country and by John H. DeForest's invitation for missionary work. After two years of teaching at Mount Holyoke, she applied for missionary work in Japan with a concrete plan to found a Mount Holyoke in Japan with three other Mount Holyoke graduates, Cora A. Stone, Caroline Telford and Elizabeth Wilkinson whom she had recruited. The proposition was made to the Prudential Committee of the American Board in 1889:

It is the desire of these three and myself to establish a Mt. Holyoke College in Japan which shall depend for its support upon native money; and when fully developed shall give full collegiate advantage to its students, to the end that young women in Japan may be trained to any sphere of usefulness to which they may be called and may do for their own and neighboring countries what the Mt. Holyoke of America has been able to do for the world.<sup>38</sup>

The plan, however, was rejected by the Japan Mission. Disappointed, Holbrook gave up the plan and decided to apply for Japan for whatever work the Japan Mission appointed. Reaching Japan, Holbrook was appointed a member of the enlargement committee of Kobe Girls' School. The idea of developing this school into a college delighted her. She wrote in December 1890 from Tottori:

You know the hope with which I thought to come—the founding of a Mt. Holyoke in Japan. That idea was given up and a broader and better one takes its place—a Christian college for women, not distinctively Holyoke, or Wellesley or Carleton, but having representatives from all three colleges and we hope some of the strong, good points of each of these schools,—not a new college, but the natural maturing of the “girls' school” now reaching out into womanhood.

She identified with this idea “as though it were the one I planned for” so thoroughly that she exclaimed, “who shall say it was not the same?”<sup>39</sup>

Even amid Westernization and the missionaries' growing ambitions, warnings against its excessiveness and its superficial nature were being voiced by some Meiji intellectuals. Fukuzawa Yukichi, a liberal who founded Keio University, wrote in *Jiji Shinpo*, a periodical in 1887:

They write excellent English compositions but cannot write Japanese letters. They know Western knitting but do not know how to sew Japanese kimonos. They can recite English poems but Japanese rarely understand this. They sing beautifully, yet rarely do Japanese families possess pianos or organs at home.... The moral education that the missionaries preach centers in the worship of Christ and is devoid of what day to day moral acts girls should follow in their families, in their relationship to parents and to husbands. Is it practical to follow Western manners in Japanese households?<sup>40</sup>

The very skills that Westernization had seen as valuable now came under attack as did the Christian culture with which the missionaries had identified Western ideas.

### **Nationalistic Sentiment in Japan and the Question of Mission Control**

When it became apparent in 1888 that the Foreign Ministry desired to overturn

Western legal protections of extraterritoriality, but backed down and instead appointed foreigners as judges in the Supreme Court and lower courts in Japan, people were infuriated. It violated the nation's independent judiciary, and it infringed upon the proposed Constitution of the Japanese Empire that was to be promulgated on February 11, 1889. Growing anti-Westernization erupted in the assassination of Mori Arinori, the Minister of Education, on the day the new Constitution was issued, and an attack on Okuma Shigenobu, the Minister of Foreign Affairs, who lost a leg in October 1889. These two incidents marked the beginning of a nationalistic era, and years of strain for the women missionaries.<sup>41</sup>

On October 30, 1890, the Imperial Rescript on Education was promulgated. The Rescript provided an answer to the Japanese quest for national identity in the 1870s and 1880s. Historian Carol Gluck states that it was a moral pronouncement by the Emperor "which linked *kokutai* [national polity] with loyalty and filiality," which had "a Confucian center," and which "made the emperor the source of a morality that was said to be both indigenous and universal at the same time."<sup>42</sup> This document became a significant icon, in retrospect, as it was used as the source of Japanese national identity grounded in the family-state system with the Emperor as the divine head of the whole patriarchy and with Confucianism as its abiding ideology.

The Rescript equipped the *minkan* [non-governmental] conservative ideologues with an effective weapon to question the loyalty of Christians on the basis that loyalty and patriotism should now center on Confucianism. The symbolic incident that demonstrated the attack on Christians by the rising Confucian conservatives was the so-called "disrespect incident" [*fukei jiken*] in January 1891. Uchimura Kanzo, a professor at the First Higher School in Tokyo, was accused of *lese majeste* when, a Christian, he refused to bow before the Imperial Rescript on Education at its ceremonial presentation to the students and faculty. As a result, Uchimura was forced to resign his position. This incident marked the rise of anti-Christianity as part of a newly-assertive Japanese national identity.

"Did I tell you that my ideas in regard to study have grown?" wrote Emily M. Brown to Susan A. Searle on August 4, 1892. "I have written to Dr. Clark and Mrs. Smith that I cannot return to the Kobe School unless I can have a year free from interruption or study at Yale or some college." Emily Brown was firmly determined to seek further academic training in the U.S. In the 1890s when women pursuing post-graduate degrees were extremely rare in the United States,<sup>43</sup> this woman missionary in her mid-thirties was resolved to go to Yale which was

opening its postgraduate course to women. Her ambition was to “return to Japan with the degree Ph.D.”<sup>44</sup>

Brown’s ambition was a response for survival amid the growing skepticism of Western culture and missionary schools among the Japanese. The rising tension proved to be a tremendous pressure and stress not only for Brown but also for all the other women missionaries at Kobe Girls’ School. Because the change of Japanese sentiment toward Western culture was so drastic within only a few years, many American missionaries could not quite comprehend what was happening. “We hardly know how to interpret many things even to ourselves and we certainly can’t foretell what may or may not happen. History is making fast these days,” wrote Holbrook in 1895.<sup>45</sup>

The high rate of health breakdowns of the missionaries in the decade through the 1890s displayed the deepening sense of insecurity and anxiety. Among the seven missionaries at Kobe Girls’ School for a term longer than five years during this decade, six of them became so sick that they had to return to the U.S. for treatment.<sup>46</sup> Of these six, it was only Susan A. Searle who would fully recover and return to Kobe College to serve out her career for another 37 years. The rest either ended in early death, mental disorder or unsuccessfully tried to return to Kobe College. Suffering from “the reaction in Japan against the education of women,” Holbrook developed diabetes. When she finally decided to return to the U.S. in April 1910, she had almost reached the end of her life. Only eight months after returning to the United States and only a few days after reaching Boston, she died at the age of 56 at her brother’s house.<sup>47</sup>

Emily M. Brown was fortunate to be able to return to Kobe College after some treatment in the U.S. Yet her subsequent failure to resume work demonstrated how severely she suffered from the strain at Kobe College caused by rising nationalistic sentiment. After 10 years of work at Kobe Girls’ School, she returned to the U.S. in 1893 for graduate work at Yale. Despite enthusiasm, she was forced to give up the graduate work and Kobe work due to a severe health breakdown. Her return to Japan in 1897 made her ill again, and in 1899 she resigned from Kobe College and returned to the U.S. in despair.

As a person on the scene, Emily M. Brown could not clearly understand how profound a cultural transformation Japan was going through, though she constantly felt threatened by the growing tension. Her initial interpretation was that the cause of the tension was the Japanese discontent with her qualifications to teach subjects in higher, advanced studies:

I do feel this day is rapidly approaching when in Japan at least, missionaries will not be considered qualified to be teachers, simply because they are Americans and have a good general education. Most certainly I was not qualified to teach psychology in an Am.[erican] College. Then neither was I to teach in a Jap.[anese] College.<sup>48</sup>

Further, Brown felt she had to modernize her methods of pedagogy which had become obsolete to retain respect from the Japanese. She concluded that she could not have “much influence over our students unless they respect us as teachers.”<sup>49</sup> With the Japanese who valued certificates, Brown reasoned that further study would be essential. She believed that “if they know that I have studied and have a degree they will rest easy with the school under foreign control longer than they otherwise would.”<sup>50</sup>

Mary Anna Holbrook’s clear vision of her mission theory exemplified her professional ambitions. Upon her arrival in the early 1890s, Holbrook pushed the college case on the grounds of preparing women graduates sufficiently to be qualified as principals at primary schools. She pressed the need to enlarge Kobe Girls’ School’s higher department so that women principals could be trained. She believed that if there were highly trained women, the Japanese would prefer women principals. She quoted the example that two Kobe graduates had applied for admission to the Imperial University in Tokyo but were rejected because they were women. She went on to suggest that if there were great demand for “high grade Christian teachers,” they should be sent to Mount Holyoke for further study.<sup>51</sup> Finally, N. G. Clark, the Foreign Secretary of the American Board, who was reluctant to accept the college idea and its expense, changed his mind because he reasoned that it would be cheaper to educate native Christian teachers at a women’s college in Japan than to send a select few to American women’s colleges.

In 1890, the three American Board girls’ schools in the *Kansai* region officially resolved to establish a college at Kobe Girls’ School with the signature of Miyagawa, the pastor of the Osaka Congregational Church. The eligibility for admission to the Academy was raised to those who graduated from the advanced primary schools, thereby raising the standard in terms of the number of years of study higher than those under the Japanese governmental system. With the curriculum revision of January 1891, the new college department was expanded to three years of study above the three-year Academy and two-year Preparatory



Department. The total years of study reached eight years. This exceeded the years of Tokyo Women's Normal School by a year; thereby Kobe College offered the highest academic pursuit available for women in Japan at the time. The women missionaries were ambitious to raise the quality of the college comparable to that of the women's colleges in the U.S. By this revision, the course of instruction of the college department "has been made very nearly equal to Mt. Holyoke or Smith College," reported the WBMI Annual Report of 1892. The WBMI rejoiced that the Japanese girls were enthusiastic to study. They studied psychology in English, using the textbooks American girls used at American women's colleges. They studied not only "Baldwin and Sully thoroughly, but they are so enthusiastic that they read up Carpenter, Hopkins and other authors, and pit one authority against another in a way that would delight the authors themselves."<sup>52</sup> Brown expressed her firm belief in June 1895 amid rising nationalistic sentiment, "For one thing only do I feel absolutely sure and that is that Kobe College is to be a power in Japan."<sup>53</sup>

N. G. Clark approved Brown's plans for women's higher education, yet wrote that the Prudential Committee rejected any new expenditures. Instead he wrote to the WBMI, urging efforts to secure the money in February 1889.

In November 1890, Dr. N. G. Clark discussed with Mrs. Moses Smith, the President of the WBMI, how to support this college expansion. Both the ABCFM and WBMI agreed that the WBMI would raise the special gift of \$12,000.00 for Kobe College alone, a large portion of the \$68,605.94 raised in 1892 for all the WBMI missionary work worldwide aside from the Kobe College fund.<sup>54</sup>

What Brown and Searle wanted to avoid along with their push for the college scheme was seeking more financial support from the Japanese, which the Japanese would not give without taking control of the school. Moreover, the issue of control was becoming a vexing question. The clash between the missionaries and the Japanese at Doshisha and Kumamoto over control and property questions in 1885 and 1893 respectively made the missionaries skeptical of the underlying Japanese intentions.

At Kumamoto, Mr. Kurahara, a Japanese who had been educated at Yale and who was the nominal holder of the title, tried to sell the houses of the missionaries during the absence of the chief missionary. The only way to save the houses was to give them to the school. The missionaries said they would do that on the condition that they be used as residences for the foreign teachers. Mr. Kurahara would not agree saying that the gift had to be unconditional because "anything

else was *evading the law and against his conscience*.” The Japanese in Kumamoto requested the Japan Mission to “withdraw all the foreign teachers from the schools as they wished to be entirely independent of foreigners.” The dispute was finally resolved by giving the property to Doshisha. Mr. Kurahara also threatened girls who were financially helped by the foreigners that if they continued to receive the aid they had to leave the school. The ultimate consequence of this dispute was the fact that the missionaries could not stay without residences, because “a residence passport cannot be procured except by teaching” and it was illegal to teach with travelling passports. Similarly Holbrook wrote that “some time ago, one of the trustees of the Osaka Girls’ School sold the property of the board without the consent of the other trustees.”<sup>55</sup>

The 1885 incident at Doshisha Girls’ School convinced the missionaries, Susan A. Searle in particular, that to ask for Japanese financial support meant to yield to Japanese intentions to obtain control of the school. Feeling it was too early to transfer the control of Kobe Girls’ School to the Japanese, Susan A. Searle and Emily M. Brown objected to the American Board’s request for the Japanese to take up a greater financial burden. This rejection signified a victory for the women missionaries over the American Board’s policy which pursued the principle of self-support and sought to transfer control to the natives’ hands as soon as possible. The fear of Japanese intentions to take over Kobe Girls’ School became even more paramount when the tide turned and the Japanese political climate plunged into the nationalistic era in the 1890s.

During the Sino-Japanese War, which began in summer 1894, two Japanese women teachers challenged the American women missionaries to give up control of Kobe College. Two young Japanese women teachers who were the leaders of a movement to bring Kobe College under Japanese control submitted a petition to the missionaries asking that the missionaries “appoint a nominal President, Treasurer and Founder for the school from among the Japanese,” reported Mary Anna Holbrook on November 13, 1894. The Japanese teachers believed that the school could be then recognized by the government and with a number of advantages for the school, teachers, and graduates, including an increase in student enrollment and lower costs since “the Japanese could purchase apparatus etc. much more cheaply than foreigners.”<sup>56</sup>

The American women responded forcefully to the challenge: “It seems to me we had better lose every student than concede one inch on this question,” wrote Holbrook. She feared the school would be registered and recognized by the

government and “would constantly be under their scrutiny.” The missionaries would not be able to revise their course of study as they wished and would lose control, as Americans had at Doshisha. Holbrook was taken aback that the woman teacher who presented the petition was one of the first students at Kobe Home, supported by a missionary of the American Board as well as sent to Mount Holyoke for further education. Though not named, the leader was probably Hirata Toshi (English name, Martha Gulick) of the first class. Holbrook wrote that she could not understand such ingratitude and was especially concerned when Hirata threatened that unless the missionaries granted the petition, Kobe College would have “only foreign children or Eurasians or girls supported by missionaries.”<sup>57</sup> Holbrook worried that it would be a significant loss for the school if Hirata resigned as a consequence of the rejection of the petition, because her English was exceptionally good and only an American would be able to fill her place.<sup>58</sup>

Almost all of the missionaries in the Japan Mission, except for John H. DeForest and perhaps Mr. Albrecht, agreed with Holbrook’s and Searle’s rejection of the petition. Two weeks later on November 26, 1894, Holbrook described the denouement:

After consultation with as many members of the mission as possible Miss Searle called the two teachers who were the leaders, and gave them a very plain, earnest talk. The amount of the whole was that if they did not like to teach in a school like this they could seek positions elsewhere; and that if students did not wish to receive the instruction we were ready to give, we could close the school, but we could not in the least concede to their request. This talk did them good, and everything appears quiet and even cordial.

Holbrook wrote that they would have to dismiss one of the teachers at the end of the year and Hirata (Martha Gulick) resigned in June 1895.<sup>59</sup> In retrospect, the women missionaries’ firm determination not to make any concessions to the Japanese appeal protected Kobe College to develop both its academic and religious education even further until the legal entity of “Specialized School” or *senmon gakko*, which did not restrict any religious education, was defined in 1903.

Control of school property was a particular focus of struggle. Foreigners were not allowed to own property outside of the *concessions*, and when they did, they asked some Japanese nominally to hold the title. The land and buildings of Kobe

Girls' School and the missionary dwellings were located in the vicinity of, but outside of the *concessions*, and the property was long nominally held by Nijjima. Upon Nijjima's death in January 1890, the Japan Mission decided to transfer the nominal ownership to Doshisha instead of to any individual. Emily M. Brown and Susan A. Searle, fearful that Kobe Girls' School would eventually be merged into Doshisha, resisted the idea. The nominal title inherited by the widow of Nijjima was transferred to the committee of three Japanese Christian men including two pastors. In 1893, "the property question" became "the most trying and immediate," Holbrook wrote to the Woman's Board, because "lately the government has been inquiring into the real ownership of all such property and has announced that it is illegal for any Japanese to so hold it."

In regard to our school property tho[ugh] we are not on the concession we are on a strip of land where foreigners can legally hold the buildings they have erected and also lease the land. We bought ours outright tho[ugh] we have it under the form of a lease from three Japanese gentlemen. It is not as secure as it might be for it could be taken for debt of these men or in case of death could be handed down to heirs who might give us trouble.... We are comparatively safe but at the expiration of the leases the property legally belongs to these gentlemen unless they are willing to lease again. We can only trust their honor.<sup>60</sup>

To solve the problem, Holbrook suggested that the property ownership be transferred to the Alumnae Association of Kobe Girls' School which was organized in June 1892, but this did not materialize because it was not a corporate body and it was all women. The problem was not resolved until the treaty revision of 1899 which abolished both the extraterritoriality clause and the *concessions*, and permitted groups of foreigners to own property in the interior if they formed a judicial body to hold real estate, incorporated as "*shadan*" under Japanese law. Hence in 1902 the American Board organized "the Association of Congregational Missionaries in Japan," which took the ownership of Kobe College property.<sup>61</sup>

During the rise of nationalistic sentiment, Susan A. Searle made efforts to sustain religious education in extracurricular work by merging the Domestic Branch with the Foreign Missionary Society and renaming it Kobe College Missionary Society in 1895. Searle reenforced this sense of sisterhood by making trips by *jinrikisha*, a man-powered vehicle, to visit alumnae from about 1902 on. Full of

gratitude, the alumnae were encouraged to keep up their faith and to spread the gospel in their surroundings. *Megumi*, the alumnae bulletin, which included Searle's letter to the alumnae, served to strengthen the bond of sisterhood among the alumnae who lived too far away to receive Searle's personal visits. Hence such efforts by Searle promoted the alumnae to grow into a valuable force for the evangelization of Japan.

### **Increasing Government Control over Women's Education**

Between 1890 and 1899, the Ministry of Education took successive legislative actions to increase control of women's education. In 1891 the Act of Secondary Schools was revised in which girls' secondary schools were legally licensed to be counterparts to previously-established boys' secondary schools. In 1894, right before the outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War, girls' education at primary schools was revised to include more practical subjects such as sewing, which finally increased the attendance rate of girls at primary schools. In 1895 the Provisions of Girls' High Schools were issued. The purpose of education was to train good-wives-wise-mothers based on the Confucian family system.<sup>62</sup> The girls' high schools emphasized domestic training including 30 hours of sewing, occupying nearly a quarter of weekly study hours. In 1897 the Ministry of Education instructed all the prefectural governments to segregate the schools by gender. The Act of Women's High Schools and Vocational Schools in 1899 mandated every prefecture to establish four-year women's high schools with an emphasis on domestic subjects.

After the Treaty Revision was enforced on July 17, the government issued on August 3 the Act of Private Schools, under which missionary schools could be licensed. Two days prior to this, on August 1, the Ministry of Education's Order Number 12 of 1899 that forbade religious education at any school authorized by the government was issued. Of all the governmental legislation, this act affected the Christian schools most substantially.

Anticipating that Kobe College would have to go under Japanese governmental jurisdiction in order to survive after the Treaty Revision was put into effect, Susan A. Searle applied for governmental recognition of Kobe College from the Ministry of Education in September. In November, Kobe College obtained the first governmental permission to found the school based on the Act of Private Schools. Searle decided to have the school under the legal category of "miscellaneous schools" (*kakushu gakko*) so that it would not be subject to the govern-

mental restrictions against religious education based on the Order Number 12 of 1899. This was the sacrifice she made to protect Christian education. Because being designated as “miscellaneous schools” deprived the graduates of the qualifications to apply to Tokyo Women’s Normal School, Searle was more determined than ever to develop Kobe’s college department and its own unique education to attract students. To survive such complicating legal restrictions, Kobe College needed to train their own teachers within their school. As a result of entering Japanese governmental jurisdiction, a copy of the Imperial Rescript of 1890 was delivered by the Japanese government in June 1900. This symbolized the nominal compromise of Christianity and Confucianism at Kobe College, which continued until the end of WWII in 1945.

In 1903 the Act of Specialized Schools (*senmon gakkō rei*) was issued, which by definition included the specialized schools offering higher education in academics and skills. Those who graduated from middle schools or women’s high schools were eligible to enter and diversity was permitted in education. The Order Number 12 of 1899 which forbade religious education applied only to government-recognized secondary schools and not to the specialized schools. Because all the other newly-founded private women’s colleges in Tokyo such as Tsuda College of 1900 and Japan Women’s University of 1901 were licensed under this Act, Susan A. Searle decided to apply for it in March 1909. On October 8, 1909, Kobe College entered Japanese legal jurisdiction as a “specialized school.” Thereby the collegiate identity that the missionaries identified with protected Kobe College’s Christian emphasis.

Kobe College was exempt from Japanese competing girls’ schools in Kobe up to 1909. The first government high school for women in Hyogo prefecture was founded in 1901. Neither this school nor all the seven private girls’ schools offered higher education. Most of the private schools were vocational sewing schools. Without competition, Kobe College enjoyed the reputation as a school of the highest education for women in Kobe.

Kobe College had tried offering a three-year sewing course in 1896 but was obliged to close the course two years later because students did not come. This proved that the Japanese were capable of choosing what school they wanted Kobe College to be. Two alumnae, Koizumi Chiyo and Ii Tazu, recalled that until about 1904, Kobe College enjoyed the reputation as the best girls’ school in the *Kansai* region, yet by 1913 that reputation had been reversed.<sup>63</sup>

### **American Aspirations in a Japanese Nation**

Amid heightening anti-foreignism, the Science Building and the Music Building, designed by Holbrook, were completed and dedicated in March 1894. Kobe Girls' School was renamed Kobe College in English and *Kobe Jogakuin* in Japanese. Holbrook managed to keep the construction expenses of these buildings at a remarkably low cost. The WBMI raised and appropriated the \$12,000 necessary for expansion. Mrs. Moses Smith, the President of the WBMI, sent the following message for the dedication ceremony:

American women, grateful for all that Christian education has done for them and their daughters, have a strong desire that the daughters of Japan may share the same high privileges. And they recognize the distinguished courtesy of the Japanese Government and people in affording them this opportunity.... The founding of Kobe College, as well as the building of these new halls, has cost not only money, but much self-denial, even to sleepless nights of prayer and planning. None of the donors have ever seen your beautiful Island Empire; yet constrained by the love of Christ they have joyfully given their treasures.<sup>64</sup>

Searle furnished religious education as well as designed courses to educate her students to reform Japanese homes and society. At the same time, she continued her efforts to adopt Japanese elements to ensure success. When only those who graduated from the Advanced Primary Schools became eligible to apply in 1890, the missionaries decided to require entrance examinations to select the new students. Such action would impress the Japanese that Kobe Girls' School was a school of high standards. In 1891, the curriculum was revised and the three-year program of the college department was established. A year later, in January 1892, Searle added courses of domestic science, hygiene, and childrearing with the hope of reforming Japanese homes. At the same time, she added courses of Japanese flower arrangement and tea ceremony as electives. Searle also systematized extracurricular religious education by observing the Great Prayer Day on the last Thursday of January. She made it an annual custom and expanded it into a one-day event on every fourth Thursday of January after 1894. Students were encouraged to spread Christianity individually to small groups of people and to children at the Sunday School of Kobe Church. Several volunteers from the college department and third-year Academy department taught about 10 children's

classes. In 1893, Searle founded the Christian Endeavor Society within Kobe Girls' School and served as its President. More than 50 students of the 70 Christian students in the school joined the society and held weekly meetings on Sunday afternoons to plan evangelical and charity work. This in 1897 became the Youth Department of the Kobe Branch of the Japan WCTU.

During the Sino-Japanese War, Susan A. Searle cooperated in war efforts. Students made two donations of over 100 knitted caps each for the soldiers at the Red Cross Hospital in Hiroshima. Yet patriotic volunteering did not stop the growing antagonism against Kobe College as a Westernized school. Tokikawa Sachi, an alumna, recalled after the Sino-Japanese War ended in 1895 that Kobe College students had volunteered to serve as waitresses for a soldiers' meeting. The soldiers gave a humiliating order that because Kobe College was the notorious Christian school founded by the Americans, the students should not serve the table but clean the toilets instead. Searle rejoiced, saying that they had to thank God that they were given a job people disliked. Tokikawa recalled that through this experience they learned perseverance and willingness to do any work.<sup>65</sup>

In addition to combining both American and Japanese elements in education, the missionaries' effective strategy to balance competing interests manifested in their use of dual identity. The use of two names, Kobe College and *Kobe Jogakuin* at the 1894 expansion was an example. Only the English name explicitly included the word "college" which served better to solicit more donations from American Christian women in the Midwest. American women would find it easier to identify with the development of a women's Christian college than secondary school in Japan. The English name expressed the American women's desire for collegiate education more covertly than the Japanese name. But the Japanese name, *Kobe Jogakuin* did not entail the concept of "college."

Another example of the use of dual identity by the missionaries was how the purpose of Kobe College was defined in the English and Japanese versions of the school catalogue after Kobe College was authorized by the Japanese Ministry of Education in 1909. The English version stated:

Its purpose is, by means of a Christian education, to train girls and young women into a harmonious development of body, mind and spirit, and thus to equip them for lives of useful service to God and to their fellowmen.



The Japanese version was:

The purpose of this institution is to impart an education essential to women and based on Christian morality, and thus to develop womanly character in accordance with the principles of the Imperial Rescript on Education.

[translated by C. B. DeForest]

The school was illustrated as a pure Christian school towards the American audience to solicit more funds. Towards the Japanese, they defined the school as an amalgam of Christianity and Confucianism in which Christianity was an element of Confucianism so that they could obtain official recognition from the Japanese government and ensure the school's stable development.

Third, records of school ceremonies for the Japanese national holidays manifested the missionaries' awareness of the two divergent interests as well as their clear priority on Christianity.<sup>66</sup> On February 11, 1900, when the National Foundation Day happened to fall on the Sabbath Day, Kobe College withheld a celebration ceremony. Instead a small meeting was held. This meeting as well as the celebration ceremony for the Emperor's Birthday on November 3, 1900 commenced and closed with the Christian hymns and prayers. Elements of Japanese culture, including poems, songs and in the latter case, the singing of *Kimigayo*, the Japanese national anthem and the recitation of the Imperial Rescript were put in the middle of the program after the Bible reading and prayers. What underlay this nominal compromise was a quiet yet persistent conviction of the missionary women that Christianity was the one and only religion, universal and superior to all other forms of religions.

In retrospect, Kobe College managed to survive the most turbulent anti-Western years and thrive as a well-respected college in the Japanese context by accommodating the divergent interests of the American missionary women and Japanese societal needs. The scientific department to which Holbrook devoted her life represented the former, in which the missionary dream ultimately failed because it was too ahead of what Japanese desired in women's education. Yet Holbrook's science courses which included domestic application of scientific knowledge, appropriate to the new field of Home Economics led by Ellen Swallow Richards, had some success. Although small in scale, it helped to inspire pioneer women science teachers in Japan. Amaya Hisa, class of 1892, and Mase Yae, class of

1902, both pursued B.S. Degrees at Carleton and Mills College, and returned to teach at Japanese women's high schools. Mase chaired the Home Economics Department at Doshisha Girls' School, and applied science to laundry. The departments of music and English were, on the other hand, the primary attractions of Kobe College. Student enrollment of the music department at Kobe College flourished with "62 pupils in instrumental music beside the vocal classes," wrote Holbrook in 1895 at the peak of anti-foreign sentiment when at one time the total enrollment dropped to a low of 55. Within the college department, the English department had been "the only major that commanded applicants enough to make up a class." Gaining Japanese respect in English education, the English-teacher training course was established in 1919, which later thrived beginning in the 1920s when the junior college was established. The shorter course with a certificate met the Japanese demand because it interfered less with marriages.

### **Conclusion**

The missionary women at Kobe College in the 1880s and 1890s displayed astute sensitivity to accommodate many competing forces both at home and in Japanese society in their efforts for college expansion. They managed to negotiate for their college idea against the biases of the American Board. They could keep control of the school during the most difficult years of anti-Christianity and xenophobia. Flexible in accommodating Japanese symbols, traditions and Japanese gender roles, the missionaries nevertheless managed to sustain their Christian values as well as initiate their missionary dream of college expansion with scientific courses. Hence the foreign missionary experience provided them an unprecedented opportunity for autonomy and empowerment, furnishing the training ground for female activism in the public place.

Kobe missionaries' success in college expansion epitomized American women gaining the authority to develop and run women's own enterprises by themselves. Abiding by the 19th century gender ideology of Victorian womanhood, the women in missions forged their own missionary society and its network to solicit funds from Christian women nationwide. The concerted efforts of women on both sides of the Pacific Ocean united in a new vision of gender-based mission theory that was codified in the slogan of "woman's work." Just like the Methodist women Robert discussed, the Congregational women's crusade for college expansion at Kobe College showed a significant shift in their mission theory. They equated Christian evangelization with women's higher education and sought

to create Japanese female Christian leaders who would spread Christianity and contribute to the social advancement of Japanese women. This holistic theory came into tension with the mission theory of the American Board, still abiding by Anderson's three-self theory. The American Board's emphasis on the mission goal to plant indigenous churches saw education of Japanese women only for the expediency of gaining access to Japanese families and to provide Christian wives to Japanese pastors.

The American Board compromised to approve Kobe expansion on the condition that the WBMI assume the financial burden. Hence the American Board rejected financial support of the plan through their appropriations. This very decision, however, opened a way for autonomy and control of women's work by the WBMI. Women missionaries felt encouraged to write directly to the WBMI to ask for funds whenever additional expansion was planned. Moreover the \$12,000 fund raising campaign for Kobe expansion strengthened the WBMI's commitment and ties to Kobe College. American women on both sides of the Pacific Ocean could utilize their special skills in fund-raising, planning, teaching, public relations and management to run this enterprise on their own. In effect, this trained women in business management. In addition, residing in foreign missions released the missionaries from direct male supervision which was otherwise inevitable in their U.S. homeland. Concurrently the location of Kobe provided a relatively favorable environment for women's autonomy compared to other American Board Stations in the vicinity. Male missionaries of the American Board increasingly moved from Kobe to Kyoto in the 1880s and created a vacuum of male power in Kobe. This male absence created an ideal space for women's autonomy based on women's mission theory. In this perspective, American women gained authority and independence through the missionary enterprise of collegiate expansion at Kobe, not available to them at home. The very success of women missionaries' work, in the end, influenced the missiology of the American Board to broaden its scope; education and civilization subsequently became the pillars of their mission work.

Two factors underlay women missionaries' firm commitment to collegiate expansion. First, the missionaries believed they were responding to Japanese indigenous demand for women's education and women's social advancement. Second, the missionaries perceived their missionary work at Kobe Girls' School as a profession which utilized the advanced education and expertise that they had acquired. Belonging to the first generation of American women with collegiate

education, the missionaries were convinced that they owed their advanced status to Christianity and the highest educational attainment they had acquired. Their missionary motivation was to utilize their expertise for the advancement of women. This motivation paralleled professionalization, a marked transformation of women's culture in the late nineteenth century America in which the first generation of college-educated women sought ways to utilize their specialized training for the betterment of society such as the settlement movement. Emily M. Brown's intention to acquire additional graduate training in the middle of her career illustrated her determination as a professional to advance her expertise. Moreover, it showed that the mission experience in Japan accelerated professionalization of the missionaries even further. This professional motivation fueled the missionaries' tenacious efforts to develop the collegiate education against the American Board's hesitation and sustain Kobe College throughout the difficult years of mounting tension against Christianity in an increasingly nationalistic Japanese society.

In sum, Kobe missionaries managed to cross the boundaries of Victorian womanhood and extend their specialized expertise in their own enterprise in the public space of a foreign land, based on nineteenth century gender ideology. Ideologically, the rhetoric of creating extended Christian "homes" in foreign missions allowed the missionaries to remain single as individuals. The goal of spreading God's Kingdom worldwide fulfilled 'piety,' the highest virtue of the four cardinal virtues of what Barbara Welter termed "the cult of true womanhood," even if their actual work involved an ambition to develop one of the pioneer women's colleges in Japan. To echo, the missionaries were, in fact, fulfilling their professional needs to utilize their expertise for the public good in addition to the missionary objective to evangelize Japan. From this perspective, the collegiate scheme at Kobe College in the 1880s demonstrated that women missionaries in the foreign field were not exempt from professionalization, an important transformation of women's culture in the U.S. in the late nineteenth century which eventually led to the birth of the "New Woman" and the demise of women's separate culture in the 1920s.

One irony lies in the fact that although the missionaries themselves managed to cross over their Victorian gender ideology through their enterprise, they transmitted this Victorian gender ideology instead to their Japanese students as Japanese formation of gender ideology proceeded under the state initiative. The missionaries sought to perpetuate Christianity and advanced education as they saw these

two as the intertwined essentials for the advancement of women. They encouraged independent thinking and their own decision making among Japanese women, yet they did not challenge the existing gender order. Instead, the missionaries encouraged Japanese women to marry and perpetuate Christianity by creating Christian homes as wives and mothers. In such a manner, they extended the Victorian gender role in Meiji Japan; their own ways of life, however, crossed its boundaries.

### Notes

An earlier version of this paper was presented at the Eleventh Berkshire Conference on the History of Women at University of Rochester in June, 1999. I would like to thank Phyllis Palmer, Roberta Wollons and Barbara B. Zikmund for their valuable insights, encouragement and criticism at various stages of my earlier drafts.

- 1 Brown to N. G. Clark, 11 January 1889, Kobe, #289, American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions Papers, Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts (hereafter abbreviated as ABCFM Papers).
- 2 I use the word "mission theory" as defined by Dana L. Robert. "... mission theory includes the motivations, goals, theological assumptions, and reflection upon practical strategies that American women employed as they participated in foreign missions." Dana L. Robert, *American Women in Mission: A Social History of Their Thought and Practice* (Macon: Mercer University Press, 1997), xx.
- 3 Noriko Kawamura Ishii, "American Women Missionaries at Kobe College, 1873-1909," Ph.D. dissertation, The George Washington University, 1998, chaps. 2-5.
- 4 Arthur Schlesinger, Jr., "The Missionary Enterprise and Theories of Imperialism," in John K. Fairbank, ed. *The Missionary Enterprise in China and America* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1974), 336-373.
- 5 The widely used notion of "woman's culture" combined what historian Nancy A. Hewitt has called the triad of Barbara Welter's "true womanhood," Nancy F. Cott's doctrine of "separate spheres," and Carroll Smith-Rosenberg's "woman's culture." Nancy A. Hewitt, "Beyond the Search for Sisterhood: American Women's History in the 1980s," in Vicki L. Ruiz and Ellen Carol DuBois, eds., *Unequal Sisters: A Multicultural Reader in U.S. Women's History*, 2nd ed. (New York: Routledge, 1994), 1-19. Barbara Welter, "The Cult of True Womanhood," *American Quarterly* 18 (Summer 1966): 151-74; Nancy F. Cott, *The Bonds of Womanhood: "Women's Sphere" in New England, 1780-1835* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1977); Carroll Smith-Rosenberg, *Disorderly Conduct: Visions of Gender in Victorian America* (New York: Knopf, 1985; New York: Oxford University Press, 1986).
- 6 William R. Hutchison, *Errand to the World: American Protestant Thought and Foreign Missions* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1987); Patricia R. Hill, *The World Their*

## Crossing Boundaries of Womanhood

*Household: The American Woman's Foreign Mission Movement and Cultural Transformation, 1870-1920* (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1985); Jane Hunter, *The Gospel of Gentility: American Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the-Century China* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1984).

- 7 Peggy Pascoe, "Gender Systems in Conflict: The Marriages of Mission-Educated Chinese American Women, 1874-1939," in Ruiz and DuBois, eds., *Unequal Sisters*, 153 n. 8.
- 8 Peggy Pascoe's work on women missionaries' home mission work with Chinese immigrant women in California displayed that the two gender systems of the white Protestant American women and Chinese immigrant women conflicted. Kowk traced the relationship of Chinese women and Protestant Christianity transmitted by American women missionaries from the late nineteenth century to the 1920s and portrayed its change over time. Christianity in nineteenth century China worked for the elevation of women's status, enabling women to "move into the public arena," yet was condemned in the 1920s as "patriarchal and conservative." Kohiyama, in her work on Presbyterian and Dutch Reformed women missionaries in early Meiji Japan, touched on this recipient response and drew portraits of three Japanese women educated in these missionary schools in the final chapter. Kohiyama suggested that the Japanese twin ideals of *ryosai kenbo* [Good Wife Wise Mother] adopted "submissiveness," "purity," and "domesticity" of the four cardinal virtues defined by Barbara Welter, but rejected the fourth virtue of "piety" or Christianity. Instead when the American Victorian womanhood transformed into good-wife-wise-mother ideology, "ie" or the feudal idea of "family/patriarchy" constituting the core of the Meiji family-state system, replaced the fourth virtue. See Pui-Lan Kowk, *Chinese Women and Christianity, 1860-1927* (Atlanta: Scalars Press, 1992); Peggy Pascoe, *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Female Moral Authority in the American West, 1874-1939* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990); Kohiyama Rui, *Amerika Fujin Senkyoshi: Rainichi no Haikai to sono Eikyo* (The 19th-Century American Women's Foreign Mission Enterprise and Its Encounter with Meiji Japan), (Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1992).
- 9 For discussion on this approach, see Yoshida Ryo, "Sougouka suru Amerikan Bodo no Dendo Jigyo" (Introduction: Multiple-transculturation of Missionary Activities of the American Board), Doshisha Daigaku Jinbunkagaku Kenkyujo, ed. *Rainichi Amerika Senkyoshi* (American Missionaries in Japan), (Tokyo: Gendai Shiryo Shuppan, 1999), 1-53.
- 10 Dana L. Robert, "From Missions to Mission to Beyond Missions," in Harry S. Stout and D. G. Hart, eds., *New Directions in American Religious History* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), 367-377.
- 11 Robert, *American Women in Mission*; R. Pierce Beaver, *American Protestant Women in World Mission: History of the First Feminist Movement in North America* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans 1980).
- 12 Although the slogan "Woman's Work for Women" was coined by Mrs. Hough, wife of the pastor of the First Congregational Church of Jackson, Michigan, the slogan was used by Methodists and they adopted this slogan as the title of their periodical. Among American Board missionaries, the term "woman's work" was commonly used.
- 13 Robert, *American Women in Mission*, 144.

- 14 Robert, *Ibid.*, 131.
- 15 Hill, 2, 23.
- 16 For a discussion on the educational, familial backgrounds and recruitment/motivation patterns of women missionaries at Kobe College from 1873 to 1909, see Ishii, 82-108.
- 17 Brown to N. G. Clark, 11 January 1889, Kobe, #289, ABCFM Papers.
- 18 For Mary Lyon's philosophy on women's education and Christianity, see Amanda Porterfield, *Mary Lyon and the Mount Holyoke Missionaries* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), 41-47; Robert, *American Women in Mission*, 92-101.
- 19 For discussions on "domestic feminism," "domestic housekeeping," "municipal housekeeping," and the application of these concepts to the settlement movement, see Karen J. Blair, *The Clubwoman as Feminist: True Womanhood Redefined, 1868-1914* (New York: Holmes & Meier Publishers, 1980), 7-13, 48-51, 73-77; Robyn Muncy, *Creating a Female Dominion in American Reform, 1890-1935* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991), 18-37.
- 20 Susan A. Searle, "Schools and Colleges for Girls: Their Aim, Scope and Results," *Proceedings of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries in Japan 1900* (Tokyo: Methodist Publishing House, 1901), 256-272, Aoyama Gakuin University Archives.
- 21 Nancy F. Cott, *The Grounding of Modern Feminism* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1987), 217.
- 22 Ruth Oldenziel, *Making Technology Masculine: Men, Women and Modern Machines in America, 1870-1945* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 1999), 58.
- 23 Margaret W. Rossiter, *Women Scientists in America: Struggles and Strategies to 1940* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982); Barbara Miller Solomon, *In the Company of Educated Women: A History of Women and Higher Education in America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985), 115-140; Geraldine Joncich Clifford, "'Marry, Stitch, Die, or Worse': Educating Women for Work," in Kantor and Tyack, eds., *Work, Youth and Schooling: Historical Perspective on Vocationalism in American Education* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1982), 223-268; Cott, *The Grounding of Modern Feminism*; Kathryn Kish Sklar, *Florence Kelley & the Nation's Work: The Rise of Women's Political Culture, 1830-1900* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1995); Ruth Bordin, *Woman and Temperance* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1981; reprint, New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1990); Blair, *The Clubwoman as Feminist*. Settlement work has caught much scholarly attention, ranging from the still important classic, Allen F. Davis, *Spearheads for Reform: The Social Settlements and the Progressive Movement, 1890-1914* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1967); Davis, *American Heroine: The Life and Legend of Jane Addams* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1973); Muncy, *Creating a Female Dominion in American Reform 1890-1935*; Ruth Hutchinson Crocker, *Social Work and Social Order: The Settlement Movement in Two Industrial Cities, 1889-1930* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1992).
- 24 "The Seventeenth Annual Report of the WBML," 1885, 13, *Annual Reports of the WBML*, Andover-Harvard Theological Seminary, Harvard University.

## Crossing Boundaries of Womanhood

- 25 J. H. DeForest, "An Appeal from Japan," 7 September 1886, Osaka, in *Life and Light for Woman*, 1887, 7-9, Kobe College Library.
- 26 These figures exclude the music normal department which was established in 1906 outside of the college department and had the first graduates in 1907. For the music normal department, the numbers of graduates from 1907 to 1909 were three, one, one respectively. Kobe College Alumnae Association, comp., ed., *Kobe College Alumnae Directory* (Kobe, 1990), 191-194. Kobe College Archives.
- 27 Charlotte B. DeForest identified the initials of E. K. A. as Secretary E. K. Alden. Charlotte B. DeForest, *History of Kobe College* (Kobe, 1950), 34.
- 28 Searle to N. G. Clark, 17 December 1887, Kobe, #163, ABCFM Papers. Student enrollment jumped from 97 in 1884 to 125 in 1885.
- 29 Sakamoto Kiyone, "Complications Experienced by American Women Missionaries: 'The Meiji 18 Incident' of Doshisha Girl's School," a paper presented at the International Conference 1996 in Kyoto, "Cultural Encounters in the Development of Modern East Asia," July 22-25, 1996.
- 30 Brown to N. G. Clark, 4 May 1885, Kobe, #282, ABCFM Papers.
- 31 Brown to N. G. Clark, 6 July 1885, #283, ABCFM Papers.
- 32 Kobe College ed., *Kobe Jogakuin Hyakunen shi: Sousetsu* (The Centennial History of Kobe College-General Survey), (Kobe: Kobe Jogakuin, 1976), 97.
- 33 Brown to N. G. Clark, 6 July 1885, #283, ABCFM Papers.
- 34 Brown to N. G. Clark, 11 January 1889, Kobe, #289, ABCFM Papers.
- 35 N. G. Clark to Susan A. Searle, 31 January 1889, ABCFM Papers.
- 36 Brown to N. G. Clark, 31 January 1889, Kobe, #290, ABCFM Papers.
- 37 Brown to N. G. Clark, 11 January 1889, Kobe, #289, ABCFM Papers.
- 38 Holbrook to the Prudential Committee, n.d., #104, A.B.C.16.4.2.v.10, Papers of the Woman's Board of Missions, Supplementary Papers and Correspondence, 1873-1909 (abbreviated as WBM-ABCFM Papers).
- 39 Holbrook to Dr. Clark, 10 December 1890, Tottori, #398, ABCFM Papers.
- 40 Murakami, Sakata Yoshio, eds., *Meiji Bunka shi* (Meiji Cultural History), Vol.3 *Kyōiku Dōtoku* (Education, Morality), (Tokyo, 1981, originally published in 1954), 231-232. English translation by author.
- 41 For a succinct and thoughtful discussion on the treaty revision controversy, see Carol Gluck, *Japan's Modern Myths: Ideology in the Late Meiji Period* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985), 114, 136-138.
- 42 Ibid., 120-121.
- 43 Percentage of women with doctorates was 1% for the year of 1890. Solomon, *In the Company of Educated Women*, 133.
- 44 Brown to N. G. Clark, 22 July 1892, Arima, #247, ABCFM Papers.
- 45 Holbrook to Mrs. Cook, 4 February 1895, Kobe, #116, A.B.C.16.4.2.v.10, WBM-ABCFM Papers.
- 46 The seven women missionaries who served at Kobe Girls' School/Kobe College for a term longer than five years from 1883 through the mid-1890s were Susan A. Searle, Emily M. Brown, Mary Anna



- Holbrook, Abbie W. Kent, Cora A. Stone, Elizabeth Torrey and Caroline M. Telford. Of these seven, only Torrey did not break down in health either physically or mentally. The remaining six were all obliged to return to the U.S. for medical treatment.
- 47 Harold L. Holbrook, "The Missionary Story in Brief of Mary Anna and Charles W. Holbrook," and an obituary of Mary A. Holbrook in *Mission News* (1910), 63 in "Mary A. Holbrook," the Biographical Files, ABCFM Papers.
  - 48 Brown to N. G. Clark, Groton, 27 March 1894, #258, ABCFM Papers.
  - 49 Brown to N. G. Clark, New Haven, 19 March 1894, #257, ABCFM Papers.
  - 50 Brown to Searle(?), 4 August 1892, Arima, in Susan A. Searle, comp., "Emily Brown Harkness (Mrs. James Harkness), Third Head of Kobe College," unpublished scrapbook, Kobe College, 1937-8, 16. Kobe College Library.
  - 51 Holbrook to Dr. Clark, 15 January 1890, Okayama, #393, ABCFM Papers.
  - 52 *The WBMI Annual Report*, 1892, 26, The Andover-Harvard Theological Seminary Library.
  - 53 Brown to Barton, 29 June 1895, Winona, #270, ABCFM Papers.
  - 54 The accumulative total raised for Kobe College fund by 1892 was \$11,638.60, almost reaching the goal of \$12,000.00. WBMI, *The Annual Report of the WBMI*, 1892, The Andover-Harvard Theological Seminary Library.
  - 55 Holbrook to Mrs. Cook, 1 October 1893, Kobe College, #115, A.B.C.16.4.2.v.10, WBM-ABCFM Papers.
  - 56 Holbrook to James L. Barton, 13 November 1894, Kobe, #416, ABCFM Papers.
  - 57 The follow-up surveys by the Kobe College Alumnae Association conducted in 1906 of both the graduates and non-graduates records two out of 264 graduates and 19 out of 798 non-graduates with non-Japanese names. These girls may be Eurasians. The graduates were those who graduated between 1882 and 1906 and the non-graduates were those who *entered* the school between 1873 and 1904. Both graduates with non-Japanese names had graduated from Kobe College after the 1890s. Twelve out of 19 non-graduates with non-Japanese names entered after the 1890s. Thus it seems that Hirata Toshi's warning might have been probable. See *Megumi*, 1906, Kobe College Library.
  - 58 Holbrook to Dr. Barton, 13 November 1894, Kobe, #416, ABCFM Papers.
  - 59 Holbrook to Dr. Barton, 26 November 1894, Kobe, #417; Holbrook to Dr. Barton's Substitute, 5 October 1895, Kobe, #421, ABCFM Papers.
  - 60 Holbrook to Mrs. Cook, 1 October 1893, #115, A.B.C.16.4.2.v.10, WBM-ABCFM Papers.
  - 61 Charlotte B. DeForest, *History of Kobe College* (Kobe, 1950), 81-82.
  - 62 The subjects to be taught at the governmental high schools for girls included morals, Japanese, foreign language, history, geography, mathematics, science, domesticity, sewing, calligraphy, art, music and physical education.
  - 63 "Koizumi Chiyo," Oral History Collection, *Kobe College Newsletter* 18 (1988.11.30), 56-60; "Ii Tazu," Oral History Collection, *Kobe College Newsletter* 19 (1990.3.15), 54-57, Kobe College Archives.
  - 64 Charlotte B. DeForest, *History of Kobe College* (Kobe, 1950), 36.

## Crossing Boundaries of Womanhood

- 65 "Tokikawa Sachi, Class of 1922," Oral History Collection, *Kobe College Newsletter* 19 (Kobe, 1990.3.15), 61, Kobe College Archives.
- 66 Kobe College Alumnae Association, ed., *Megumi* (Kobe College Alumnae Bulletin) vol.23(March 1900), 3; *Ibid.*, vol. 25 (December 1900) 4-5, Kobe College Library.